**Carver Elementary School Building Committee**

**September 10, 2015 - 7:30 P.M.**

**Minutes of Meeting**

**CARVER TOWN HALL – SELECTMEN’S CHAMBERS**

**Approved 10/1/15**

Members Present: Liz Sorrell, Heather Sepulveda, Richard Ward, Michael Milanoski, Ruby Maestas, Peter Gray, Dan Ryan, John Cotter, Dave Siedentopf, James O’Brien, Andrew Soliwoda, Sarah Stearns, Jon Delli Priscoli.

Members Absent:

HMFH Present: Devin Canton, Laura Wernick, Matt LaRue.

PMA Present: Chad Crittenden, Chris Carroll, Walter Hartley.

Others Present: Matt, Carol and Kyle Spiewakowski, Helen Marrone, Gina Hanlon-Cavicchi, Scott Knief, Alan Dunham, Tish Leatherbee, Mary Ross, Paula Foley, Caroline Todd, Kerry Agashe, Brie Wall, Kristin Moore, Jen Frohnapfel,

1. Chairman Dick Ward called the meeting to order at 7:30 pm. He then led the committee in the Pledge of Allegiance.
2. **08-31-15 Meeting Minutes**

Discussion by committee.

**Motion made by Dan Ryan to approve minutes and second by John Cotter. Dan Ryan made a motion to have all motions in future minutes to be separate of paragraphs, bold and underline. Second by John Cotter. This will be done in all future minutes.**

**Unanimous vote for amended minutes.**

1. **Overview of Meeting Agenda**

Mr. Ward gave an overview of the agenda for this evening.

Mr. Ward is concerned with the meeting format for this evening. He noted that there will be some differences of opinions; please be respectful. He would like to change public comment section. If public has seen an item that has been missed, please notify the chairman and you will have two minutes to present your concern.

Mr. Ward had all Building Committee Members introduce themselves to the public.

Liz asked Mr. Ward to open School Committee meeting in open session due to a quorum being present.

**Gina Hanlon-Cavicchi made this motion.**

**Second by Andrew Soliwoda.**

**Unanimous.**

1. Schematic Estimate Update was given by Chad Crittenden.

He showed the committee a slide with MSBA School Trend Data, cost per SF trends. $299 per square foot is the cap from MSBA. Construction costs are increasing continuously. MSBA’s estimate increases by end of year to be $350 per square foot and by the time we go out to bid on this project most likely will be more than that.

He then spoke about the Reconciled Schematic Estimate. PM & C (estimate of record – HMFM’s estimator) $44,602,460; AM Fogarty (OPM’s estimate) $44,831,204. MSBA @$299 per square foot $35,347,994.

Liz asked if this is based on everything in building or is it based on the value engineering cut list. Chad replied that all that is in current design is included in this price. He added that these figures are for construction costs only; they do not include soft costs, FF&E or contingencies. Chad asked if there were any questions; none. Reconciliation came within ½%. James asked, does this have escalation included? Chad replied yes that 3% escalation was included. John Cotter asked if FF&E costs ($2 million) were included? Chad replied no. 20% reimbursable soft cost + $1.8 million for furniture and technology + contingencies.

Tax Impact for Proposed Project slide was then shown to the committee. This slide shows the impact to taxpayers based on single family house, condo and mobile homes. Cost per unit @$20 million district share: $331 (home), $283 (condo), $39 (mobile home); Cost per unit @$27 million district share: $447 (home), $382 (condo); $53 (mobile home). Mike added that this is for a 25 year level payment bond. These costs per unit would be fixed. These are estimates at this point. Once we come to a final budget, these numbers will be refined. This is just a starting point. Mike added that anything over the $20 million district share figure is something that the Town will likely have to pick up 100%. John Cotter asked if we accept the $4 million in consultant recommended cost reductions, does that lower the number? It’s already in there, Mike replied. He also added if this isn’t accepted, the figure goes up. If the committee cuts more, the figure will then go down.

VE Option Selection (live update)

Chad spoke about the HVAC system. Liz reached out to other communities with the dehumidification systems. Liz received information from West Bridgewater School; they have this system and during the hottest days recently, 68-73 degrees was the temperature inside the building. Chad feels this is perfect temperature. At Rochester School, on the recent hot days, temperatures ranged from 69 to 74.7 degrees. The warmest room was a two story art room facing south with windows on the two full stories; this is why the temperature is high in that room. Chad asked if there were any questions. John asked if our choices were this system or a full blown air conditioning system or is there a middle level option? Chad replied that a full blown air conditioning system has a lot of copper pipe, a lot of individual units and a lot of controls. The next step up from this would be a displacement system with increased cooling capacity. In a dehumidification system, the intent is to shut boilers off or to limit their activity whereas with increased cooling capacity you may need to temper the colder air in cooler rooms by running the boilers. Richard asked if any other differences you see to reduce costs? Chad spoke about outside air ventilation system without dehumidification and the recent issues experienced by other districts. They do not recommend this system. In the gym, this system could work. Chad added that $200,000 savings for going with the basic code required outside air ventilation system. $680,000 premium for full air conditioning system. He noted that there have been less complaints with dehumidification system in the last few projects they have worked on. Liz asked about cafeteria and MPR, could those units be changed? Would it be a stand-alone unit? Yes, replied Chad.

VE-CPA Proposed $1.5 million Total.

Items that could be pulled out to be funded by CPA: Savings

 Irrigation $351,407

 Two southernmost soccer fields $70,885

 Change all fields to plain seeded lawn $176,240

 Play areas; change to seeded lawn $220,000

 Reduce play equipment by 100% $300,000

 Eliminate planting areas in courtyards, replace with seeded lawn $27,939

 Reduce plantings by 100% $214,518

 Eliminate basketball court $85,581

 Eliminate seating (benches) $63,600

Mike noted that these items have been removed from the $27 million budget and are seeking an alternate funding source, the CPA.

John Cotter cautioned that Town Meeting has not approved a bonded transaction with regards to the CPA fund since the North Carver water district. He added that there has been a goal of spending what you have; not borrowing into the future.

Ruby asked why these items taken out without educator input? Mike replied they are not taken out of project, they are just getting funded from another source (this is proposed CPA). Ruby is concerned that these may be taken out of project. There is no guarantee that these would be approved by CPA. Both will be voted on at the same time. Ruby feels she needs to be involved in these decisions; as they are related to the Educational Program. Ruby’s concern is that there wasn’t any educator input when removing these items from the base scope. She is concerned about that. Sarah Stearns, how do these get prioritized from here. Does this committee have input on this? Mike replied that this list is recreational needs and they not in any prioritized order. This is whole package of $1.5 million. Ruby added that some of these items she sees as recreational; others are directly related to the Educational Program. Liz added that our responsibility is to all of our children; these items will impact them. Liz feels some of these items should be included in the submitted budget to MSBA to guarantee we get support for our student s. Matt and Carol Spiewakowski spoke about the playground. Heather asked what will happen to these items if CPA doesn’t approve them. Mike replied that there will be a warrant article at town meeting. She asked, if the school passes and these items don’t, what happens? Mike replied that we will need to provide other funding. Mike also noted that MSBA will only guarantee 8% for site work. Jon Delli Priscoli would like to see if there could be some community involvement to reduce costs for these site work items. Jon feels there would be a lot of help from the community. Ruby asked shouldn’t this committee have made these decisions? Mike replied that’s what tonight is for. This list is just a recommendation coming from the consultants; this is just a starting point.

Value Engineering – Live Update.

Chad will run through all of the items on the list; then discussion line item by item. A vote will be taken for each item individually; some will need to be voted on as a group.

CES Principal and CPS Facilities VE Recommendations

Ruby and Dave have present a power point to the committee with their concerns. Ruby noted that her presentation is based on the list she received two weeks ago; not the list that was sent out to committee members a few hours ago. Mike noted that the first list was a draft list; noting that we would have a final list after the estimators met today. Richard allows Ruby and Dave to give their presentation with a 6 minute limit. Dave feels we should go through the most up to date list noting hold on items that there will need to be discussion.

John Cotter asked what total cost from today was. Chad replied, $52.8 million for total project cost, $27,026,165.05 would be district share. $57.8 million with no cuts made; $32 million district share.

At this time in the meeting, the committee will go over each item on the Value Engineering list, line by line. Chad went line by line and gave a brief description of each item with their recommendation.

**Accepted=coming out of project scope; Rejected=stays in project scope.**

#1 Hold

#2 Rejected

#3 Accepted

 #4 Rejected

 #5 Hold

 #6 Hold

 #7Hold

 #8 Hold

 #9 Hold.

 #10 Rejected

 #11 Rejected

 #12 &13 Hold

 #14 Accepted

 #15 Hold

 #16 Hold

 #17 Eliminate skylights:

 #18 Accepted

 #19 Rejected

 #20 Hold

 #21 Eliminate clerestories:

 #22 Hold

 #23 Accepted

 #24 Hold

 #25

 #26 Hold

 #27 Hold

 #28 Rejected

 #29 Accepted

 #30 Accepted

 #31 Accepted

 #32 Rejected

 #33 Accepted

 #34 Hold

 #35 Rejected

 #36 Hold

 #37Hold

 #38 Hold

 #39 Hold

 #40 Rejected

 #41Rejected

 #42 Accepted

 #43 Accepted

 #44 Accepted

 #45 Rejected

 #46 Hold

 #47 Rejected

 #48 Accepted

 #49

 #50 Hold

 #51Hold

 #52 Hold

 #53Hold

 #54 Hold

 #55 Hold

 #56 Hold

 #57 Hold

 #58 Hold

 #59 Accepted

 #60Accepted

 #61 Accepted

 #62 Accepted

 #63 Hold

 #64 Hold

 #65 Hold

 #66 Accepted

 #67 Accepted

 #68 Hold

 #69 Hold

 #70 Accepted

 #71 Hold

 #72 Hold

PMA led the committee through every item with discussion on each item. Those items which were immediately accepted were noted and there was a “hold” on items for further discussion. **There was a motion made by Dan Ryan to reject items 50-55. There was a second by James O’Brien. The vote was unanimous to reject these items.**

After discussion, **there was a motion made by James O’Brien, second by Dan Ryan to accept PMA’s recommendation to accept the following line items: 3,4,10,14,18,19,23,28,29,30,31,32,33,40,41,42,43,44,45,47,48,59,60,61,62,66,67,and 70 for a total of $1,091,811.00 of value engineering. It was voted unanimously to accept.**

A line item by line item discussion continued on whether to accept or reject a proposed cut as a part of value engineering.

The following is a summary of motions and actions record below:

Item 6-change to eliminate $82,000 from site curbing cost-accepted-vote:9-1

Item 8-elimination of 15% of parking spaces-accepted-vote: 6-5

Item 9- eliminate stockade fence facing Chance Court- rejected – vote: unanimous

Item 12-eliminate curved roof in gym and admin area-rejected- vote: 8-3

Item 13-eliminate curved administrative roof-rejected-vote: 7-4

Item 15-eliminate curved cafeteria wall-rejected-vote: 8-3

Item 16-eliminate large stair vestibule at west wing-rejected-vote: 8-3

Item 20 eliminate multipurpose room motorized shades-accepted-vote: unanimous

Item 22 eliminate clerestory windows in reception area-rejected-vote: 10-1

Item 24 eliminate masonry and replace with CMU-accepted –vote: unanimous

Item 26 eliminate roof screens-accepted-vote: unanimous

Item 27 eliminate book collection overlook into gym-accepted-vote: unanimous

Item 34 change cafeteria window shades from motorized to manual-accepted- vote: unanimous

Item 35 reserve $20,000 (eliminate $47,589) for shades-accepted-vote: unanimous

Item 37 eliminate wood caps on counter tops-rejected-vote: unanimous

Item 36 change from wood caps to laminate-rejected-vote: unanimous

Item 38 eliminate upper storage above lockers-accepted- vote: unanimous

Item 39 eliminate doors between classrooms-rejected-vote: unanimous

Item 46 Delete operable partition in multipurpose room-rejected-vote-not taken

This item was not accepted or rejected

Item 49 HVAC option of 100% conditioned air (dehumidification)-accepted-vote: unanimous

Items-50-55 eliminate other HVAC options-accepted-vote: unanimous

Item 56 change from soldered to Pro-Press fittings (mechanical)

Item 69 change from soldered to Pro – Press fittings (plumbing) –these two items were accepted-vote: unanimous

Item 57 consolidate number of Roof Top units –accepted-vote: unanimous

Item 58 change classroom fixtures from pendant to 2x4 recessed-accepted-vote: 8-3

Item 63 eliminate 4 data drops per classroom was changed to keep 1 data drop per classroom-accepted-vote: unanimous

Item 64 change from lightening prevention system to lightning supression system

-accepted-vote: unanimous

Item 65 eliminate lightening prevention all together-rejected- vote: unanimous

Item 68 eliminate paging system, use telephones instead changed to use telephone system with speakers in large group spaces, hallways, and bathrooms-accepted-vote: 9 -2

Item 71- eliminate gym divider curtain-rejected-vote: unanimous

Item 72 – eliminate tray wash machine- accepted-vote: 7-4

**#**1 Dave feels this road should be fully paved for various reasons. **Motion to reject by Dan Ryan, second by James O’Brien. Unanimous vote.**

#2 is now rejected.

#6Curbing. Granite is less susceptible to damage. Precast doesn’t hold up to snow removal or heavy trucks. Jon feels we should go with slope granite. Mike suggests rejecting this**.**

**Motion by Jon Delli Priscoli to cut $82,000 from site curbing costs, second by Dan Ryan. 9 to 1 vote.**

#8Parking Spaces. Ruby noted her constant concern for additional parking spaces. Dan asked about having overflow parking that is not paved? There was a brief discussion about this. **Liz Sorrell moves to reject this (reduction in parking spaces). Ruby Maestas second.** **5 for, 6 opposed.**

#9 James O’Brien regarding a 6 foot high stockade fence along Chance Court. **James O’Brien made a motion to put aside $10,000 for this purpose. Jon Delli Priscoli second. Unanimous vote.** Mr. Ward will notify Chance Court residents**.**

**#12 Curved roof in gym and admin area. Liz Sorrell made a motion to continue rejection of this elimination. Second by Jon Delli Priscoli. Favor of keeping the curved areas: 8 in favor, 3 opposed. Stays in.**

#13 **Liz made a motion of keep administrative curved areas. Second by Jon Delli Priscoli. Vote: 7 to 4.**

#15 Curved wall in cafeteria. **Liz made a motion to keep the curved wall in cafeteria. Second by Jon Delli Priscoli. Discussion. In favor of keeping curved wall: 8; 3 opposed.**

#16 Delete larger stair vestibule at west classroom wing. **Jon Delli Priscoli made a motion to move this to accept the rejection. John Cotter second. 8 to keep it; 3 opposed. Reject.**

**#**20 Multipurpose Room motorized shades. The motorized shades are on the three skylights. **Liz made a motion to reject this. John Cotter second. (keep skylights and shades). Unanimous vote.**

#22 Eliminate clerestories at administration area. **Liz made a motion to keep the clerestories window in admin area. Ruby seconded. (this is to reject) 10 to 1.**

#24Masonry. Dave gave his concerns. **James O’Brien made a motion to accept. Ruby second. (accepting this line item) Unanimous vote.**

#26 Roof screens. **James O’Brien made a motion to accept as recommended; Dan Ryan second. Eliminate. Unanimous vote.** Liz noted that this might need to be modified at some point.

#27 Book collection**.** Ruby wanted some more information regarding this. You could still look into the gym. **James O’Brien made a motion to accept as recommended; Jon Delli Priscoli second. Unanimous vote.**

#34 Change window shades from motorized to manual in cafeteria. **Motion to accept by Dan Ryan; second by Ruby Maestas. Unanimous vote.**

#35 Shades. Reserve $20,000 for shades.  **Dan Ryan made a motion to accept $47,589. Jon Delli Priscoli second. Unanimous vote.**

#37 **James O’Brien motion to reject this (keep wood caps). Liz Sorrell second. Unanimous.**

#36 **James O’Brien made a motion to accept rejection. Liz Sorrell seconded. Unanimous.**

#38 Discussion about storage space in classrooms. **Liz made a motion to accept elimination. Second by Jon Delli Priscoli. Unanimous vote.**

#39 Classroom communicating doors.Dave has concerns with safety issues. **James O’Brien made a motion to reject; second by John Cotter. Unanimous vote to reject.**

#46 Liz noted that this is a huge part of the educational program.This is essential. **Liz Sorrell made a motion to keep partition and do not put it on cut list. Ruby Maestas second.** Mike suggested accept recommendation for now with the ability to put it in under the alt. reno.Liz feels this is a horrible educational decision to remove this item. **Liz withdraws her motion until later.**

**#49** HVAC System

**#50 Motion to reject items 50-55made by Dan Ryan. Second by James O’Brien.**

**#51**

**#52 Unanimous vote.**

**#53**

**#54**

**#55**

#56 & 69 Pro Press Fittings. **Dan Ryan made a motion to accept. John Cotter second. Unanimous vote.**

#57 Roof tops units on wings. **Jon Delli Priscoli motion to accept. James O’Brien second. Unanimous vote.**

#58 Change classroom fixtures from pendant to 2x4 recessed.  **Jon Delli Priscoli made a motion to accept. James O’Brien second. 8 to 3 vote.**

#63 Liz suggested only one drop per classroom. **Dan Ryan made a motion to have one drop per classroom. John Cotter second. Unanimous vote.**

#64 Change lightning prevention system to lightning suppression system.  **Dave Siedentopf made a motion to accept. Second by James O’Brien. Unanimous.**

#65 **Dave Siedentopf made a motion to reject. James O’Brien second. Unanimous vote.**

#68Paging system. Use telephones instead. Ruby feels this is a safety issue.

**Move to accept $27,000 by Dan Ryan. Second by John Cotter.** Adam Holmes spoke about safety of all staff, students. Ruby does not recommend this. **9 to 2 vote.**

#71Eliminate gym divider curtain. **James O’Brien made a motion to reject. Dan Ryan second. Unanimous vote to reject.**

#46 **Liz Sorrell made motion to reject recommendation. James O’Brien second. 10 to 1**

#72 Eliminate tray wash machine.Liz doesn’t feel we should do this. **John Cotter made a motion to accept. Dan Ryan second. 7 to 4 vote.**

Heather wants to make sure at some point in the plan, extra parking spaces could be added. She just wants to make sure this isn’t overlooked.

**Dan Ryan made a motion to accept/approve the items targeted for CPA funding in full ($1.5 million). Jon Delli Priscoli second.** Ruby needs clarification. She is concerned she wasn’t consulted. She wants to make sure this is funded. Mike Milanoski clarified that nothing has been cut or removed from the project; the only thing this does is put it on to CPA to fund these items. There will be a Special Town Meeting on 12/1. A stand-alone article for CPA funds will be voted on at that time. He reiterated that nothing has been cut from the project. It is the Selectmen’s call as to how this project is funded.

Scott Knief asked if play areas will be handicapped accessible and rubberized? Yes.

Carol Spiewakowski has a concern about if these items are taken out of project. Alan Dunham explained this process to her.

John Cotter reiterated that Town Meeting has not approved a bonded transaction with regards to the CPA fund since the North Carver water district.

**Jon Delli Priscoli moves question, unanimous to take vote on questions.**

**Vote: to accept $1.5 million of recreation items as part of the project from CPA funds; 9 to 2 vote.**

**Liz made a proposal to recommend to Board of Selectmen to have Ballot election on 12/12. Andrew Soliwoda second. Unanimous.**

Motion made by Liz to approve the reconciled budget of not to exceed $53 Million total pending final adjustments. This will be voted at Selectmen’s Meeting on 9/15/15.

Alan Dunham is concerned about how long the meeting on Tuesday will take. He feels just representatives from this committee should attend.

Next meeting: Tuesday, 9/15/15 Meeting: Monday, 9/28/15 at 7 pm (tentative)

**Motion made by John Cotter to adjourn meeting at 12:05 am. Second by Dan Ryan.**

**Unanimous vote.**

**Gina made motion to adjourn School Committee Meeting at 12:05 am. James O’Brien second.**

Respectfully Submitted,

Kelly Yenulevich,

Building Committee Recording Secretary